

**EDWARD GONSHOROWSKI, on behalf of
himself all others similarly situated,**

Plaintiff,

v.

SPENCER GIFTS LLC,

Defendant.

SUPERIOR COURT OF NEW JERSEY

LAW DIVISION: ATLANTIC COUNTY

DOCKET NO: ATL-L-000311-22

CIVIL CLASS ACTION

SETTLEMENT AGREEMENT

This Settlement Agreement, dated as of this 17th day of August 2022, is made and entered into by and among the following Settling Parties (as defined below): (i) Edward Gonshorowski (“Plaintiff”), individually and on behalf of the Settlement Class (as defined below), by and through his counsel of record MILBERG COLEMAN BRYSON PHILLIPS GROSSMAN PLLC (“Plaintiff’s Counsel”); and (ii) Spencer Gifts LLC (“Spencer Gifts”), by and through its counsel of record, BAKER & HOSTETLER LLP. The Settlement Agreement is subject to Court approval and is intended by the Settling Parties to fully, finally, and forever resolve, discharge, and settle the Released Claims (as defined below), upon and subject to the terms and conditions hereof.

I. THE LITIGATION

Plaintiff alleges that, on November 25, 2021, Spencer Gifts detected a “security incident” and, upon learning of the incident, notified law enforcement and began an investigation. *Complaint* at ¶ 27. Through its investigation, Spencer Gifts learned that “an unauthorized actor accessed its network between November 24, 2021 and November 26, 2021, including certain files contained on its servers.” *Id.* Plaintiff further alleges that Spencer Gifts “reviewed those files and identified documents relating to payroll and enrollment in its employee health plan,” which “contained individuals’ names, Social Security Numbers, health plan selection, and financial

account numbers used for direct deposit.” *Id.* at ¶ 28. Plaintiff also alleges that he received notice from Spencer Gifts on or about January 21, 2022, which notified him that “his personal data (including his name and social security number and financial account number [and health plan selection])” was involved. *Id.* at ¶¶ 20, 29. Following this notification, Plaintiff filed this lawsuit asserting various claims against Spencer Gifts relating to the Data Incident as defined below (the “Litigation”).

Pursuant to the terms set out below, this Settlement Agreement provides for the resolution of all claims and causes of action asserted, or that could have been asserted, against Spencer Gifts and the Released Persons (as defined below) relating to the Data Incident, by and on behalf of Plaintiff and Settlement Class Members (as defined below), and any other such actions by and on behalf of any other individuals originating, or that may originate, in jurisdictions in the United States of America (“United States”, as defined below) against Spencer Gifts and the Released Persons relating to the Data Incident.

II. CLAIMS OF PLAINTIFF AND BENEFITS OF SETTLING

Plaintiff believes that the claims asserted in the Litigation, as set forth in the Complaint, have merit. Plaintiff and Class Counsel (as defined below) recognize and acknowledge, however, the expense and length of continued proceedings necessary to prosecute the Litigation against Spencer Gifts through motion practice, trial, and potential appeals. They have also considered the uncertain outcome and risk of further litigation, as well as the difficulties and delays inherent in such litigation. Class Counsel are highly experienced in class-action litigation and very knowledgeable regarding the relevant claims, remedies, and defenses at issue in cybersecurity incident litigation in general and in this Litigation in particular. They have determined that the

settlement set forth in this Settlement Agreement is fair, reasonable, and adequate, and in the best interests of the Settlement Class.

III. DENIAL OF WRONGDOING AND LIABILITY

Spencer Gifts denies each and all of the claims and contentions alleged against it in the Litigation. Spencer Gifts denies all charges of wrongdoing or liability as alleged, or which could be alleged, in the Litigation. Nonetheless, Spencer Gifts has concluded that further litigation would be protracted and expensive, and that it is desirable that the Litigation be fully and finally settled in the manner and upon the terms and conditions set forth in this Settlement Agreement. Spencer Gifts has considered the uncertainty and risks inherent in any litigation. Spencer Gifts has, therefore, determined that it is desirable and beneficial that the Litigation be settled in the manner and upon the terms and conditions set forth in this Settlement Agreement.

IV. TERMS OF SETTLEMENT

NOW, THEREFORE, IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED AND AGREED, by and among Plaintiff, individually and on behalf of the Settlement Class, Class Counsel, and Spencer Gifts that, subject to the approval of the Court, the Litigation and the Released Claims shall be finally and fully compromised, settled, and released, and the Litigation shall be dismissed with prejudice as to the Settling Parties, the Settlement Class, and the Settlement Class Members, except those Settlement Class Members who lawfully opt-out of the Settlement Agreement, upon and subject to the terms and conditions of this Settlement Agreement, as follows:

1. Definitions

As used in the Settlement Agreement, the following terms have the meanings specified below:

1.1 “Agreement” or “Settlement Agreement” means this agreement.

1.2 “Claims Administration” means the processing and payment of claims received from Settlement Class Members by the Claims Administrator (as defined below).

1.3 “Claims Administrator” means Postlethwaite & Netterville, a company experienced in administering class action claims generally and specifically those of the type provided for and made in data-breach litigation.

1.4 “Claims Deadline” means the postmark and/or online submission deadline for Valid Claims (as defined below) pursuant to ¶ 2.1.4.

1.5 “Claim Form” means the form utilized by the Settlement Class Members to submit a Settlement Claim (as defined below) for reimbursement. The Claim Form will be substantially in a form as shown in **Exhibit C** attached hereto, which will be available on both the Settlement Website (as defined below) and in paper format, if specifically requested by a Settlement Class Member.

1.6 “Costs of Claims Administration” means all actual costs associated with or arising from Claims Administration.

1.7 “California Statutory Claim Benefits” refers to the approximately 1,064 California resident Settlement Class members who will be eligible for a separate, California statutory damages award as set forth in ¶ 2.1.3 below.

1.8 “Court” means the Superior Court of New Jersey, Atlantic County.

1.9 “Data Incident” means the unauthorized access to Spencer Gifts’ network between November 24, 2021 and November 26, 2021, including, but not limited to, certain files relating to payroll and enrollment in its employee health plan, which contained individuals names, Social Security Numbers, health plan selection, and financial account numbers used for direct deposit, and which was discovered by Spencer Gifts on or about November 25, 2021.

1.10 “Effective Date” means the first date by which all of the events and conditions specified in ¶ 1.11 herein have occurred and been met.

1.11 “Final” means the occurrence of all of the following events: (i) the settlement pursuant to this Settlement Agreement is finally approved by the Court; (ii) the Court has entered a Judgment (as defined below); and (iii) the time to appeal or seek permission to appeal from the Judgment has expired or, if appealed, the appeal has been dismissed in its entirety, or the Judgment has been affirmed in its entirety by the court of last resort to which such appeal may be taken, and such dismissal or affirmance has become no longer subject to further appeal or review. Notwithstanding the above, any order modifying or reversing any attorneys’ fee award or service award made in this case shall not affect whether the Judgment is “Final” as defined herein or any other aspect of the Judgment.

1.12 “Judgment” means a judgment rendered by the Court.

1.13 “Long Notice” means the long form notice of settlement posted on the Settlement Website, substantially in the form as shown in **Exhibit B** hereto.

1.14 “Objection Date” means the date by which Settlement Class Members must mail their objection to the settlement for that objection to be effective. The postmark date shall constitute evidence of the date of mailing for these purposes.

1.15 “Opt-Out Date” means the date by which Settlement Class Members must mail their requests to be excluded from the Settlement Class for that request to be effective. The postmark date shall constitute evidence of the date of mailing for these purposes.

1.16 “Person” means an individual, corporation, partnership, limited partnership, limited liability company or partnership, association, joint stock company, estate, legal representative, trust, unincorporated association, government or any political subdivision or agency thereof, and

any business or legal entity, and their respective spouses, heirs, predecessors, successors, representatives, or assignees.

1.17 “PII” means, but is not limited to, individual names, Social Security Numbers, health plan selection, financial account numbers used for direct deposit, or any other information leading to notification regarding the Data Incident.

1.18 “Plaintiff” or “Class Representative” means Edward Gonshorowski.

1.19 “Preliminary Approval Order” means the order preliminarily approving the Settlement Agreement and ordering that notice be provided to the Settlement Class. The Settling Parties’ proposed form of Preliminary Approval Order is attached hereto as **Exhibit D**.

1.20 “Settlement Class Counsel” and/or “Class Counsel” means the law firm of MILBERG COLEMAN BRYSON PHILLIPS GROSSMAN PLLC.

1.21 “Related Entities” means Spencer Gifts, LLC and its respective past or present parents, subsidiaries, divisions, and related or affiliated entities, and each of its and their respective predecessors, successors, directors, officers, principals, agents, attorneys, insurers, and reinsurers, and includes, without limitation, any Person related to any such entity who is, was or could have been named as a defendant in any of the actions in the Litigation, other than any Person who is found by a court of competent jurisdiction to be guilty under criminal law of initiating, causing, aiding or abetting the criminal activity occurrence of the Data Incident or who pleads *nolo contendere* to any such charge.

1.22 “Released Claims” shall collectively mean any and all past, present, and future claims and causes of action including, but not limited to, any causes of action arising under or premised upon any statute, constitution, law, ordinance, treaty, regulation, or common law of any country, state, province, county, city, or municipality, including 15 U.S.C. §§ 45 *et seq.*, and all

similar statutes in effect in any states in the United States; violations of the New Jersey and similar state consumer protection statutes including but not limited to the California Consumer Privacy Act and California Unfair Competition Law; negligence; negligence *per se*; breach of contract; breach of implied contract; breach of fiduciary duty; breach of confidence; invasion of privacy; fraud; misrepresentation (whether fraudulent, negligent or innocent); unjust enrichment; bailment; wantonness; failure to provide adequate notice pursuant to any breach notification statute or common law duty; and including, but not limited to, any and all claims for damages, injunctive relief, disgorgement, declaratory relief, equitable relief, attorneys' fees and expenses, pre-judgment interest, credit monitoring services, the creation of a fund for future damages, statutory damages, punitive damages, special damages, exemplary damages, restitution, and/or the appointment of a receiver, whether known or unknown, liquidated or unliquidated, accrued or unaccrued, fixed or contingent, direct or derivative, and any other form of legal or equitable relief that either has been asserted, was asserted, or could have been asserted, by any Settlement Class Member against any of the Released Persons based on, relating to, concerning or arising out of the Data Incident or the allegations, transactions, occurrences, facts, or circumstances alleged in or otherwise described in the Litigation. Released Claims shall not include the right of any Settlement Class Member, Class Counsel, or any of the Released Persons to enforce the terms of the settlement contained in this Settlement Agreement, and shall not include the claims of Settlement Class Members who have timely excluded themselves from the Settlement Class.

1.23 "Released Persons" means Spencer Gifts and the Related Entities.

1.24 "Settlement Claim" means a claim for settlement benefits made under the terms of this Settlement Agreement.

1.25 “Settlement Class” means “All persons who were sent written notification by Spencer Gifts LLC (“Spencer Gifts”) that their PII was potentially compromised as a result of the unauthorized access to Spencer Gifts network that Spencer Gifts discovered on or about November 25, 2021 (the “Data Incident”).” The Settlement Class specifically excludes: (i) Spencer Gifts, the Related Entities, and their officers and directors; (ii) all Settlement Class Members who timely and validly request exclusion from the Settlement Class; (iii) the judge assigned to this case; and (iv) any other Person found by a court of competent jurisdiction to be guilty under criminal law of initiating, causing, aiding or abetting the criminal activity occurrence of the Data Incident or who pleads *nolo contendere* to any such charge.

1.26 “Settlement Class Member(s)” or “Member(s)” means a Person(s) who falls within the definition of the Settlement Class.

1.27 “Settlement Website” means the website described in ¶ 3.2(c).

1.28 “Settling Parties” means, collectively, Spencer Gifts and Plaintiff, individually and on behalf of the Settlement Class.

1.29 “Short Notice” means the content of the mailed notice to the proposed Settlement Class Members, substantially in the form as shown in **Exhibit A** attached hereto. The Short Notice will direct recipients to the Settlement Website and inform Settlement Class Members, among other things, of the Claims Deadline, the Opt-Out Date, the Objection Date, the requested attorneys’ fees, and the date of the Final Fairness Hearing (as defined below).

1.30 “Unknown Claims” means any of the Released Claims that any Settlement Class Member, including Plaintiff, does not know or suspect to exist in his/her favor at the time of the release of the Released Persons that, if known by him or her, might have affected his or her settlement with, and release of, the Released Persons, or might have affected his or her decision

not to object to and/or to participate in this Settlement Agreement. With respect to any and all Released Claims, the Settling Parties stipulate and agree that upon the Effective Date, Plaintiff intends to and expressly shall have, and each of the other Settlement Class Members intend to and shall be deemed to have, and by operation of the Judgment shall have, waived the provisions, rights, and benefits conferred by California Civil Code § 1542, and also any and all provisions, rights, and benefits conferred by any law of any state, province, or territory of the United States (including, without limitation, California Civil Code §§ 1798.80 *et seq.*, Montana Code Ann. § 28-1-1602; North Dakota Cent. Code § 9-13-02; and South Dakota Codified Laws § 20-7-11), which is similar, comparable, or equivalent to California Civil Code § 1542, which provides:

A GENERAL RELEASE DOES NOT EXTEND TO CLAIMS THAT THE CREDITOR OR RELEASING PARTY DOES NOT KNOW OR SUSPECT TO EXIST IN HIS OR HER FAVOR AT THE TIME OF EXECUTING THE RELEASE, AND THAT, IF KNOWN BY HIM OR HER, WOULD HAVE MATERIALLY AFFECTED HIS OR HER SETTLEMENT WITH THE DEBTOR OR RELEASED PARTY.

Settlement Class Members, including Plaintiff, may hereafter discover facts in addition to, or different from, those that they, and any of them, now know or believe to be true with respect to the subject matter of the Released Claims, but Plaintiff expressly shall have, and each other Settlement Class Member shall be deemed to have, and by operation of the Judgment shall have, upon the Effective Date, fully, finally and forever settled and released any and all Released Claims. The Settling Parties acknowledge, and Settlement Class Members shall be deemed by operation of the Judgment to have acknowledged, that the foregoing waiver is a material element of the Settlement Agreement of which this release is a part.

1.31 “United States” as used in this Settlement Agreement includes all 50 states, the District of Columbia and all territories.

1.32 “Valid Claims” means Settlement Claims in an amount approved by the Claims Administrator or found to be valid through the claims processing and/or dispute resolution process described in ¶ 2.5.

2. Settlement Benefits

2.1 Expense Reimbursement.

2.1.1 Documented Ordinary Losses

- a) Documented Out-Of-Pocket Expenses. All Settlement Class Members who submit a Valid Claim using the Claim Form, including necessary supporting documentation, are eligible for the following documented out-of-pocket expenses, not to exceed \$500 per Settlement Class Member, that were incurred as a result of the Data Incident: (i) unreimbursed bank fees; (ii) long distance phone charges; (iii) cell phone charges (only if charged by the minute); (iv) data charges (if charged based on the amount of data used); (v) postage; and (vi) gasoline for local travel purchased by Settlement Class Members between November 24, 2021 and the Claims Deadline. Claims for documented out-of-pocket expenses may be combined with claims for documented fees for credit reports, credit monitoring or other identity theft insurance products and reimbursement of lost time and are subject to the same \$500 cap. To receive reimbursement for documented out-of-pocket expenses, Settlement Class Members must submit a Valid Claim, including documentation supporting their claims, to the Claims Administrator. This can include receipts or other documentation that is “self-prepared” by the claimant that documents the costs incurred. “Self-prepared”

documents, such as handwritten receipts, can also be considered to add clarity or support other submitted documentation. Any “self-prepared” documentation is subject to the Settlement Administrators review for plausibility.

- b) *Documented Fees for Credit Reports, Credit Monitoring, or Other Identity Theft Insurance Products.* All Settlement Class Members who submit a Valid Claim using the Claim Form, including necessary supporting documentation, are eligible to receive reimbursement for credit reports, credit monitoring, or another identity theft insurance products purchased between November 24, 2021 and the Claims Deadline, not to exceed \$500 per Settlement Class Member. Claims for fees for credit reports, credit monitoring, or other identity theft insurance products may be combined with claims for documented out-of-pocket expenses and reimbursement of lost time and are subject to the same \$500 cap. To receive reimbursement for documented fees for credit reports, credit monitoring, or other theft insurance products, Settlement Class Members must submit a Valid Claim, including documentation supporting their claims, to the Claims Administrator. This can include receipts or other documentation that is “self-prepared” by the claimant that documents the costs incurred. “Self-prepared” documents, such as handwritten receipts, can also be considered to add clarity or support other submitted documentation. Any “self-prepared” documentation is subject to the Settlement Administrators review for plausibility.
- c) *Reimbursement of Lost Time.* Settlement Class Members are also eligible to receive reimbursement for up to three (3) hours of lost time spent dealing with the Data Incident (calculated at the rate of \$20 per hour), but only if at least one (1) full hour was spent dealing with the Data Incident. Settlement Class Members may receive up to three (3)

hours of lost time if the Settlement Class Member (i) attests that any claimed lost time was spent responding to issues raised by the Data Incident; and (ii) provides a written description (utilizing the “array” approach) of how the claimed lost time was spent related to the Data Incident. Claims for reimbursement of lost time may be combined with claims for documented out-of-pocket expenses and documented fees for credit reports, credit monitoring, or other identity theft insurance products and are subject to the same \$500 cap.

2.1.2 Documented Extraordinary Losses. Settlement Class Members are also eligible to receive reimbursement for documented Extraordinary Losses, not to exceed \$3,000 per Settlement Class Member for documented monetary losses if the loss: (i) is actual, documented, and unreimbursed; (ii) was more likely than not caused by the Data Incident; (iii) occurred between November 24, 2021 and the Claims Deadline; and (iv) is not already covered by one or more of the above-referenced reimbursable expense categories under documented Ordinary Losses. Settlement Class Members must also have made reasonable efforts to avoid, or seek reimbursement for, such Extraordinary Losses, including but not limited to exhaustion of all available credit monitoring insurance and identity theft insurance. Settlement Class Members with Extraordinary Losses must submit substantial and plausible documentation supporting their claims. This can include receipts or other documentation not “self-prepared” by the claimant that documents the costs incurred. “Self-prepared” documents such as handwritten receipts are, by themselves, insufficient to receive reimbursement for Extraordinary Losses, but can be considered to add clarity or support other submitted documentation.

2.1.3 California Statutory Claim Benefit. In addition to the benefits above, the approximately 1,064 California resident Settlement Class members are also eligible for a separate,

California Statutory Claims Benefit. California resident Settlement Class members who submit a Valid Claim shall be eligible for a \$50 cash payment upon written verification that they lived at a valid California address at the time of the Data Incident. The California Statutory Claim Benefit can be combined with a claim for Ordinary Losses in ¶¶ 2.1.1(a)-(c), and/or, if applicable, with reimbursement for Extraordinary Losses in ¶ 2.1.2, and shall be subject to the \$500 cap on compensation for Ordinary Losses in ¶¶ 2.1.1(a)-(c).

2.1.4 Settlement Class Members seeking reimbursement under ¶ 2.1 must complete and submit a Claim Form to the Claims Administrator, postmarked or submitted online on or before the 90th day after the deadline for the commencement of notice to Settlement Class Members as set forth in ¶ 3.2(d). The notice to the Settlement Class will specify this deadline and other relevant dates described herein. The Claim Form must be verified by the Settlement Class Member with a statement that his or her claim is true and correct, to the best of his or her knowledge and belief. Notarization shall not be required. Failure to provide supporting documentation for Ordinary Losses (other than reimbursement of lost time) and Extraordinary Losses, referenced above, as requested on the Claim Form, shall result in denial of a claim. For the reimbursement of up to three (3) hours of lost time claimed by Settlement Class Members, the Settlement Class Member need only provide an attestation that the time claimed was spent responding to issues raised by the Data Incident and a description of how the time was spent.

2.2 Limitation on Reimbursable Expenses. Nothing in this Settlement Agreement shall be construed as requiring Spencer Gifts to provide, and Spencer Gifts shall not be required to provide, for a double payment for the same loss or injury that was reimbursed or compensated by any other source. No payment shall be made for emotional distress, personal/bodily injury, or

punitive damages, as all such amounts are not recoverable pursuant to the terms of the Settlement Agreement.

2.3 Identity Theft Protection. All Settlement Class Members who have enrolled in the one year of credit monitoring previously offered by Spencer Gifts shall have the term of the credit monitoring previously offered automatically extended by two (2) years, without requiring the filing of a claim for monetary compensation. Any Settlement Class Members who did not previously enroll for credit monitoring shall have the ability to make a claim for two (2) years of monitoring under the same service offered by Spencer Gifts, without requiring the filing of a claim for monetary compensation. Spencer Gifts will pay for the credit monitoring services separate and apart from other settlement benefits.

2.4 Confirmatory Discovery and Business Practice Changes. Spencer Gifts has agreed to provide sufficient documentation to demonstrate that it either has implemented or will implement various security related measures for a period of two (2) years. Costs associated with these business practice commitments will be paid by Spencer Gifts separate and apart from other settlement benefits. Spencer Gifts agrees to provide confirmatory discovery establishing the appropriateness of settlement terms as contemplated under N.J. Court Rule 4:32. A copy of the security-related matters implemented may be filed with the Court, under seal, pursuant to an agreed upon Confidentiality Order entered by the Court. Upon request, Spencer Gifts will also provide Class Counsel with a good-faith estimate of the cost enhancements since the Data Incident.

2.5 Dispute Resolution for Claims.

2.5.1 The Claims Administrator, in its sole discretion to be reasonably exercised, will determine whether: (i) the claimant is a Settlement Class Member; (ii) the claimant has provided all information needed to complete the Claim Form, including any documentation that may be

necessary to reasonably support the expenses described in ¶ 2.1; and (iii) the information submitted could lead a reasonable person to conclude that more likely than not the claimant has suffered the claimed losses as a result of the Data Incident. The Claims Administrator may, at any time, request from the claimant, in writing, additional information as the Claims Administrator may reasonably require in order to evaluate the claim, *e.g.*, documentation requested on the Claim Form, and required documentation regarding the claimed losses. The Claims Administrator's initial review will be limited to a determination of whether the claim is complete and plausible. For any claims that the Claims Administrator determines to be implausible, the Claims Administrator will submit those claims to the Settling Parties (one Plaintiff's lawyer shall be designated to fill this role for Plaintiff). If the Settling Parties do not agree with the Claimant's claim, after meeting and conferring, then the claim shall be referred to a claims referee for resolution. The Settling Parties will mutually agree on the claims referee should one be required.

2.5.2 Upon receipt of an incomplete or unsigned Claim Form or a Claim Form that is not accompanied by sufficient documentation to determine whether the claim is facially valid, the Claims Administrator shall request additional information ("Claim Supplementation") and give the claimant twenty-one (21) days to cure the defect before rejecting the claim. Requests for Claim Supplementation shall be made within thirty (30) days of receipt of such Claim Form or thirty (30) days from the Effective Date, whichever comes later. In the event of unusual circumstances interfering with compliance during the twenty-one (21) day period, the claimant may request and, for good cause shown (illness, military service, out of the country, mail failures, lack of cooperation of third parties in possession of required information, etc.), shall be given a reasonable extension of the twenty-one (21) day deadline in which to comply; however, in no event shall the deadline be extended to later than six (6) months from the Effective Date. If the defect is not

timely cured, then the claim will be deemed invalid and there shall be no obligation to pay the claim.

2.5.3 Following receipt of additional information requested by the Claims Administrator, the Claims Administrator shall have ten (10) days to accept, in whole or lesser amount, or reject each claim. If, after review of the claim and all documentation submitted by the claimant, the Claims Administrator determines that such a claim is facially valid, then the claim shall be paid. If the Claim Administrator determines that such a claim is not facially valid because the claimant has not provided all information needed to complete the Claim Form and enable the Claim Administrator to evaluate the claim, then the Claim Administrator may reject the claim without any further action. If the claim is rejected in whole or in part, for other reasons, then the claim shall be referred to the claims referee.

2.5.4 If any dispute is submitted to the claims referee, the claims referee may approve the Claims Administrator's determination by making a ruling within fifteen (15) days of the claims referee's receipt of the submitted dispute. The claims referee may make any other final determination of the dispute or request further supplementation of a claim within thirty (30) days of the claims referee's receipt of the submitted dispute. The claims referee's determination shall be based on whether the claims referee is persuaded that the claimed amounts are reasonably supported in fact and were more likely than not caused by the Data Incident. The claims referee shall have the power to approve a claim in full or in part. The claims referee's decision will be final and non-appealable. Any claimant referred to the claims referee shall reasonably cooperate with the claims referee, including by either providing supplemental information as requested or, alternatively, signing an authorization allowing the claims referee to verify the claim through third-party sources, and failure to cooperate shall be grounds for denial of the claim in full. The claims

referee shall make a final decision within thirty (30) days of the latter of the following events: its receipt of the submitted dispute and receipt of all supplemental information requested.

2.6 Settlement Expenses. All costs for notice to the Settlement Class as required under ¶¶ 3.1 and 3.2, Costs of Claims Administration under ¶¶ 8.1, 8.2, and 8.3, and the costs of dispute resolution described in ¶ 2.5, shall be paid by Spencer Gifts.

2.7 Settlement Class Certification. The Settling Parties agree, for purposes of this settlement only, to the certification of the Settlement Class. If the settlement set forth in this Settlement Agreement is not approved by the Court, or if the Settlement Agreement is terminated or cancelled pursuant to the terms of this Settlement Agreement, this Settlement Agreement, and the certification of the Settlement Class provided for herein, will be vacated and the Litigation shall proceed as though the Settlement Class had never been certified, without prejudice to any Person's or Settling Party's position on the issue of class certification or any other issue. The Settling Parties' agreement to the certification of the Settlement Class is also without prejudice to any position asserted by the Settling Parties in any other proceeding, case or action, as to which all of their rights are specifically preserved.

3. Order of Preliminary Approval and Publishing of Notice of Fairness Hearing

3.1. As soon as practicable after the execution of the Settlement Agreement, Plaintiff's Counsel and counsel for Spencer Gifts shall jointly submit this Settlement Agreement to the Court, and Plaintiff's Counsel will file a motion for preliminary approval of the settlement with the Court requesting entry of a Preliminary Approval Order in the form attached hereto as **Exhibit D**, or an order substantially similar to such form in both terms and cost, requesting, *inter alia*:

- a) certification of the Settlement Class for settlement purposes only pursuant to ¶ 2.7;
- b) preliminary approval of the Settlement Agreement as set forth herein;

- c) appointment of MILBERG COLEMAN BRYSON PHILLIPS GROSSMAN PLLC as Class Counsel;
- d) appointment of Plaintiff as Class Representative;
- e) approval of a customary form of Short Notice to be mailed by first-class United States Postal Service (“USPS”) mail to Settlement Class Members in a form substantially similar to **Exhibit A**, attached hereto.
- f) approval of the Long Notice to be posted on the Settlement Website in a form substantially similar to **Exhibit B**, attached hereto, which, together with the Short Notice, shall include a fair summary of the Settling Parties’ respective litigation positions, the general terms of the settlement set forth in the Settlement Agreement, instructions for how to object to or opt-out of the settlement, the process and instructions for making claims to the extent contemplated herein, the requested attorneys’ fees, and the date, time and place of the Final Fairness Hearing;
- g) approval of the Claim Form to be available on the Settlement Website for submitting claims and available, upon request, in a form substantially similar to **Exhibit C**, attached hereto; and
- h) appointment of Postlethwaite & Netterville as the Claims Administrator.

3.2 Spencer Gifts shall pay for providing notice to the Settlement Class in accordance with the Preliminary Approval Order, and the costs of such notice, together with the Costs of Claims Administration. Any attorneys’ fees, costs, and expenses of Plaintiff’s Counsel, and a service award to the Class Representatives, as approved by the Court, shall be paid by Spencer Gifts as set forth in ¶ 7 below. Notice shall be provided to Settlement Class Members by the Claims Administrator as follows:

- a) *Class Member Information*: Within fourteen (14) days of entry of the Preliminary Approval Order, Spencer Gifts shall provide the Claims Administrator with the name and physical address of each Settlement Class Member (collectively, “Class Member Information”) that Spencer Gifts and/or the Released Entities possess. Spencer Gifts warrants and represents that it will provide the most current Class Member Information for all Settlement Class Members as such information is contained in its or the Released Entities’ records.
- b) The Class Member Information and its contents shall be used by the Claims Administrator solely for the purpose of performing its obligations pursuant to this Agreement and shall not be used for any other purpose at any time. Except to administer the Settlement as provided in this Agreement, or to provide all data and information in its possession to the Settling Parties upon request, the Claims Administrator shall not reproduce, copy, store, or distribute in any form, electronic or otherwise, the Class Member Information.
- c) *Settlement Website*: Prior to the dissemination of the Short Notice, the Claims Administrator shall establish the Settlement Website, that will inform Settlement Class Members of the terms of this Agreement, their rights, dates and deadlines and related information. The Settlement Website shall include, in .pdf format and available for download, the following: (i) the Long Notice; (ii) the Claim Form; (iii) the Preliminary Approval Order; (iv) this Agreement; (v) the operative Class Action Complaint filed in the Litigation; and (vi) any other materials agreed upon by the Settling Parties and/or required by the Court. The Settlement Website shall

provide Settlement Class Members with the ability to complete and submit the Claim Form, and supporting documentation, electronically.

d) *Short Notice:* Within forty-five (45) days of entry of the Preliminary Approval Order and to be substantially completed not later than sixty (60) days after entry of the Preliminary Approval Order, subject to the requirements of this Agreement and the Preliminary Approval Order, the Claims Administrator will provide notice to the Settlement Class members as follows:

- via first-class USPS mail to the postal address provided to Spencer Gifts and/or the Released Entities by the Settlement Class Members. Before any mailing under this paragraph occurs, the Claims Administrator shall run the postal addresses of Settlement Class Members through the USPS National Change of Address database to update any change of address on file with the USPS within thirty (30) days of entry of the Preliminary Approval Order;
- in the event that a Short Notice is returned to the Claims Administrator by the USPS because the address of the recipient is not valid, and the envelope contains a forwarding address, the Claims Administrator shall re-send the Short Notice to the forwarding address within seven (7) days of receiving the returned Short Notice;
- in the event that subsequent to the first mailing of a Short Notice, and at least fourteen (14) days prior to the Opt-Out Date and the Objection Date, a Short Notice is returned to the Claims

Administrator by the USPS because the address of the recipient is no longer valid, i.e., the envelope is marked “Return to Sender” and does not contain a new forwarding address, the Claims Administrator shall perform a standard skip trace, in the manner that the Claims Administrator customarily performs skip traces, in an effort to attempt to ascertain the current address of the particular Settlement Class Member in question and, if such an address is ascertained, the Claims Administrator will re-send the Short Notice within seven (7) days of receiving such information. This shall be the final requirement for mailing.

- The date of the first-mailing of the Short Notice shall be deemed the “notice commencement date” for purposes of calculating the opt-out and objection deadlines, and all other deadlines that flow from the notice commencement date
- e) Publishing, on or before the date of mailing the Short Notice, the Claim Form and the Long Notice on the Settlement Website as specified in the Preliminary Approval Order, and maintaining and updating the Settlement Website throughout the claim period;
- f) A toll-free help line shall be made available to provide Settlement Class Members with additional information about the settlement and to respond to Settlement Class Members’ questions. The Claims Administrator also will provide copies of the Short Notice, Long Notice, and paper Claim Form, as well as this Settlement Agreement, upon request to Settlement Class Members; and

- g) Contemporaneously with seeking Final approval of the Settlement, Class Counsel and Spencer Gifts shall cause to be filed with the Court an appropriate affidavit or declaration with respect to complying with this provision of notice.

3.3 The Short Notice, Long Notice, and other applicable communications to the Settlement Class may be adjusted by the Claims Administrator, respectively, in consultation and agreement with the Settling Parties, as may be reasonable and not inconsistent with such approval. The notice program shall commence within forty-five (45) days after entry of the Preliminary Approval Order and shall be completed within sixty (60) days after entry of the Preliminary Approval Order.

3.4 Class Counsel and Spencer Gifts' counsel shall request that after notice is completed, the Court hold a hearing (the "Final Fairness Hearing") and grant final approval of the settlement set forth herein.

4. Opt-Out Procedures

4.1 Each Person wishing to opt-out of the Settlement Class shall individually sign and timely submit written notice of such intent to the designated Post Office box established by the Claims Administrator. The written notice must clearly manifest a Person's intent to be excluded from the Settlement Class. To be effective, written notice must be postmarked no later than sixty (60) days after the date on which the notice program commences pursuant to ¶ 3.2(d).

4.2 All Persons who submit valid and timely notices of their intent to be excluded from the Settlement Class, as set forth in ¶ 4.1 above, referred to herein as "Opt-Outs," shall not receive any cash benefits of and/or be bound by the terms of this Settlement Agreement. All Persons falling within the definition of the Settlement Class who do not request to be excluded from the

Settlement Class in the manner set forth in ¶ 4.1 above shall be bound by the terms of this Settlement Agreement and Judgment entered thereon.

4.3 In the event that within ten (10) days after the Opt-Out Date as approved by the Court, there have been more than one hundred (100) timely and valid Opt-Outs (exclusions) submitted, Spencer Gifts may, by notifying Class Counsel and the Court in writing, void this Settlement Agreement. If Spencer Gifts voids the Settlement Agreement pursuant to this paragraph, Spencer Gifts shall be obligated to pay all settlement expenses already incurred, excluding any attorneys' fees, costs, and expenses of Class Counsel and service awards and shall not, at any time, seek recovery of same from any other party to the Litigation or from counsel to any other party to the Litigation.

5. Objection Procedures

5.1 Each Settlement Class Member desiring to object to the Settlement Agreement shall submit a timely written notice of his or her objection by the Objection Date. Such notice shall state: (i) the objector's full name, address, telephone number, and e-mail address (if any); (ii) information identifying the objector as a Settlement Class Member, including proof that the objector is a member of the Settlement Class (e.g., copy of notice, copy of original notice of the Data Incident); (iii) a written statement of all grounds for the objection, accompanied by any legal support for the objection the objector believes applicable; (iv) the identity of any and all counsel representing the objector in connection with the objection; (v) a statement as to whether the objector and/or his or her counsel will appear at the Final Fairness Hearing; (vi) the objector's signature and the signature of the objector's duly authorized attorney or other duly authorized representative (along with documentation setting forth such representation); and (vii) a list, by case name, court, and docket number, of all other cases in which the objector and/or the objector's

counsel has filed an objection to any proposed class action settlement within the last three (3) years. To be timely, written notice of an objection in the appropriate form must be filed with the Clerk of the Court and contain the case name and docket number *Gonshorowski v. Spencer Gifts, LLC*, Case No. ATL-L-000311-22 (the “*Spencer Gifts Action*”), no later than sixty (60) days from the date on which notice program commences pursuant to ¶ 3.2(d), and served concurrently therewith upon Class Counsel, MILBERG COLEMAN BRYSON PHILLIPS GROSSMAN PLLC, 5335 Wisconsin Ave., Suite 440, Washington, D.C. 20015; and counsel for Spencer Gifts, Eric R. Fish, BAKER & HOSTETLER, LLP, 45 Rockefeller Plaza, New York, New York 10111.

5.2 Any Settlement Class Member who fails to comply with the requirements for objecting in ¶ 5.1 shall waive and forfeit any and all rights he or she may have to appear separately and/or to object to the Settlement Agreement, and shall be bound by all the terms of the Settlement Agreement and by all proceedings, orders and judgments in the Litigation. The exclusive means for any challenge to the Settlement Agreement shall be through the provisions of ¶ 5.1. Without limiting the foregoing, any challenge to the Settlement Agreement, the final order approving this Settlement Agreement, or the Judgment to be entered upon final approval shall be pursuant to appeal under the New Jersey Rules of Appellate Procedure and not through a collateral attack.

6. Releases

6.1 Upon the Effective Date, each Settlement Class Member, including Plaintiff, shall be deemed to have, and by operation of the Judgment shall have, fully, finally, and forever released, relinquished, and discharged all Released Claims. Further, upon the Effective Date, and to the fullest extent permitted by law, each Settlement Class Member, including Plaintiff, shall, either directly, indirectly, representatively, as a member of or on behalf of the general public or in any capacity, be permanently barred and enjoined from commencing, prosecuting, or participating

in any recovery in any action in this or any other forum (other than participation in the settlement as provided herein) in which any of the Released Claims is asserted.

6.2 Upon the Effective Date, Spencer Gifts shall be deemed to have, and by operation of the Judgment shall have, fully, finally, and forever released, relinquished, and discharged, Plaintiff, each and all of the Settlement Class Members, Class Counsel and Plaintiff Counsel, of all claims, including Unknown Claims, based upon or arising out of the institution, prosecution, assertion, settlement, or resolution of the Litigation or the Released Claims, except for enforcement of the Settlement Agreement. Any other claims or defenses Spencer Gifts may have against such Persons including, without limitation, any claims based upon or arising out of any retail, banking, debtor-creditor, contractual, or other business relationship with such Persons that are not based upon or do not arise out of the institution, prosecution, assertion, settlement, or resolution of the Litigation or the Released Claims are specifically preserved and shall not be affected by the preceding sentence.

6.3 Notwithstanding any term herein, neither Spencer Gifts nor their Related Parties, shall have or shall be deemed to have released, relinquished or discharged any claim or defense against any Person other than Plaintiff, each and all of the Settlement Class Members, Class Counsel and Plaintiff's Counsel.

7. Plaintiff Counsel's Attorneys' Fees, Costs, and Expenses; Service Award to Plaintiff

7.1 The Settling Parties did not discuss the payment of attorneys' fees, costs, expenses and/or service award to Plaintiff, as provided for in ¶¶ 7.2 and 7.3, until after the substantive terms of the settlement had been agreed upon, other than that Spencer Gifts would not object to a request for reasonable attorneys' fees, costs, expenses, and a service award to Plaintiff as may be ordered

by the Court. Spencer Gifts and Class Counsel then negotiated and agreed to the provision described in ¶ 7.2.

7.2 Spencer Gifts has agreed not to object to a request by Class Counsel for attorneys' fees, inclusive of any costs and expenses of the Litigation, subject to Court approval, in an amount not to exceed \$195,000. Class Counsel, in their sole discretion, shall allocate and distribute any amount of attorneys' fees, costs, and expenses awarded by the Court among Plaintiff's Counsel.

7.3 Subject to Court approval, Spencer Gifts has agreed not to object to a request for a service award in the amount of \$2,500 to each named Plaintiff (for a total payment of \$2,500).

7.4 If awarded by the Court, Spencer Gifts shall pay the attorneys' fees, costs, expenses, and service awards to Plaintiff, as set forth above in ¶¶ 7.2, 7.3, and 7.4, within twenty-one (21) days after the Effective Date. Class Counsel shall thereafter distribute the award of attorneys' fees, costs, and expenses among Plaintiff's Counsel and service awards to Plaintiff consistent with ¶¶ 7.2 and 7.3.

7.5 The amount(s) of any award of attorneys' fees, costs, and expenses, and the service award to Plaintiff, are intended to be considered by the Court separately from the Court's consideration of the fairness, reasonableness, and adequacy of the settlement. These payments will not in any way reduce the consideration being made available to the Settlement Class as described herein. No order of the Court, or modification or reversal or appeal of any order of the Court, concerning the amount(s) of any attorneys' fees, costs, expenses, and/or service awards ordered by the Court to Class Counsel or Plaintiff shall affect whether the Judgment is Final or constitute grounds for cancellation or termination of this Settlement Agreement.

8. Administration of Claims

8.1 The Claims Administrator shall administer and calculate the claims submitted by Settlement Class Members under ¶ 2.1. Class Counsel and Spencer Gifts shall be given reports as to both claims and distribution and have the right to review and obtain supporting documentation to the extent necessary to resolve claims administration issues. The Claims Administrator's and claims referee's, as applicable, determination of whether a Settlement Claim is a Valid Claim shall be binding, subject to the dispute resolution process set forth in ¶ 2.5. All claims agreed to be paid in full by Spencer Gifts shall be deemed a Valid Claim.

8.2 Checks for Valid Claims shall be mailed and postmarked within sixty (60) days of the Effective Date, or within thirty (30) days of the date that the claim is approved, whichever is later.

8.3 All Settlement Class Members who fail to timely submit a claim for any benefits hereunder within the time frames set forth herein, or such other period as may be ordered by the Court, or otherwise expressly allowed by law or the Settling Parties' written agreement, shall be forever barred from receiving any payments or benefits pursuant to the settlement set forth herein, but will in all other respects be subject to, and bound by, the provisions of the Settlement Agreement, the releases contained herein and the Judgment.

8.4 No Person shall have any claim against the Claims Administrator, Claims Referee, Spencer Gifts, Released Persons, Class Counsel, Plaintiff, Plaintiff's Counsel, and/or Spencer Gifts' counsel based on distributions of benefits to Settlement Class Members.

8.5 Information submitted by Settlement Class Members in connection with submitted claims under this Settlement Agreement shall be deemed confidential and protected as such by the Claims Administrator, Claims Referee, Class Counsel, and counsel for Spencer Gifts.

9. Conditions of Settlement, Effect of Disapproval, Cancellation, or Termination

9.1 The Effective Date of the settlement shall be conditioned on the occurrence of all of the following events:

- a) the Court has entered the Order of Preliminary Approval and Publishing of Notice of a Final Fairness Hearing, as required by ¶ 3.1;
- b) Spencer Gifts has not exercised its option to terminate the Settlement Agreement pursuant to ¶ 4.3;
- c) the Court has entered the Judgment granting final approval to the settlement as set forth herein; and
- d) the Judgment has become Final, as defined in ¶ 1.11.

9.2 If all conditions specified in ¶ 9.1 hereof are not satisfied, the Settlement Agreement shall be canceled and terminated subject to ¶ 9.4 unless Class Counsel and counsel for Spencer Gifts mutually agree in writing to proceed with the Settlement Agreement.

9.3 Within seven (7) days after the Opt-Out Date, the Claims Administrator shall furnish to Class Counsel and to Spencer Gifts's counsel a complete list of all timely and valid requests for exclusion (the "Opt-Out List").

9.4 In the event that the Settlement Agreement or the releases set forth in ¶¶ 6.1, 6.2, and 6.3 above are not approved by the Court or the settlement set forth in the Settlement Agreement is terminated in accordance with its terms: (i) the Settling Parties shall be restored to their respective positions in the Litigation and shall jointly request that all scheduled Litigation deadlines be reasonably extended by the Court so as to avoid prejudice to any Settling Party or Settling Party's counsel; (ii) the terms and provisions of the Settlement Agreement shall have no further force and effect with respect to the Settling Parties and shall not be used in the Litigation

or in any other proceeding for any purpose, and (iii) any judgment or order entered by the Court in accordance with the terms of the Settlement Agreement shall be treated as vacated, *nunc pro tunc*. Notwithstanding any statement in this Settlement Agreement to the contrary, no order of the Court or modification or reversal on appeal of any order reducing the amount of attorneys' fees, costs, expenses, and/or service awards shall constitute grounds for cancellation or termination of the Settlement Agreement. Further, notwithstanding any statement in this Settlement Agreement to the contrary, Spencer Gifts shall be obligated to pay amounts already billed or incurred for costs of notice to the Settlement Class, and Claims Administration, and shall not, at any time, seek recovery of same from any other party to the Litigation or from counsel to any other party to the Litigation.

10. Miscellaneous Provisions

10.1 The Settling Parties (i) acknowledge that it is their intent to consummate this Settlement Agreement; (ii) agree to cooperate to the extent reasonably necessary to effectuate and implement all terms and conditions of this Settlement Agreement; and (iii) agree to exercise their best efforts to accomplish the terms and conditions of this Settlement Agreement.

10.2 The Settling Parties intend this settlement to be a final and complete resolution of all disputes between them with respect to the Litigation. The settlement compromises claims that are contested and shall not be deemed an admission by any Settling Party as to the merits of any claim or defense. The Settling Parties each agree that the settlement was negotiated in good faith by the Settling Parties and reflects a settlement that was reached voluntarily after consultation with competent legal counsel. The Settling Parties reserve their right to rebut, in a manner that such party determines to be appropriate, any contention made in any public forum that the Litigation was brought or defended in bad faith or without a reasonable basis. It is agreed that no Party shall

have any liability to any other Party as it relates to the Litigation, except as set forth in the Settlement Agreement.

10.3 Neither the Settlement Agreement, nor the settlement contained herein, nor any act performed or document executed pursuant to or in furtherance of the Settlement Agreement or the settlement (i) is or may be deemed to be or may be used as an admission of, or evidence of, the validity or lack thereof of any Released Claim, or of any wrongdoing or liability of any of the Released Persons; or (ii) is or may be deemed to be or may be used as an admission of, or evidence of, any fault or omission of any of the Released Persons in any civil, criminal or administrative proceeding in any court, administrative agency or other tribunal. Any of the Released Persons may file the Settlement Agreement and/or the Judgment in any action related to the Data Incident that may be brought against them or any of them in order to support a defense or counterclaim based on principles of *res judicata*, collateral estoppel, release, good faith settlement, judgment bar, or reduction or any other theory of claim preclusion or issue preclusion or similar defense or counterclaim.

10.4 The Settlement Agreement may be amended or modified only by a written instrument signed by or on behalf of all Settling Parties or their respective successors-in-interest.

10.5 The Settlement Agreement contains the entire understanding between Spencer Gifts and Plaintiff regarding the payment of the *Spencer Gifts* Action and supersedes all previous negotiations, agreements, commitments, understandings, and writings between Spencer Gifts and Plaintiff in connection with the payment of the *Spencer Gifts* Action. Except as otherwise provided herein, each party shall bear its own costs. This Agreement supersedes all previous agreements made between Spencer Gifts and Plaintiff. Any agreements reached between Spencer Gifts, Plaintiff, and any third party, are expressly excluded from this provision.

10.6 Class Counsel, on behalf of the Settlement Class, are expressly authorized by Plaintiff to take all appropriate actions required or permitted to be taken by the Settlement Class pursuant to the Settlement Agreement to effectuate its terms, and also are expressly authorized to enter into any modifications or amendments to the Settlement Agreement on behalf of the Settlement Class which they deem appropriate in order to carry out the spirit of this Settlement Agreement and to ensure fairness to the Settlement Class.

10.7 Each counsel or other Person executing the Settlement Agreement on behalf of any party hereto hereby warrants that such Person has the full authority to do so.

10.8 The Settlement Agreement may be executed in one or more counterparts. All executed counterparts shall be deemed to be one and the same instrument. A complete set of original executed counterparts shall be filed with the Court.

10.9 The Settlement Agreement shall be binding upon, and inure to the benefit of, the successors and assigns of the parties hereto. No assignment of this Settlement Agreement will be valid without the other party's prior, written permission.

10.10 The Court shall retain jurisdiction with respect to implementation and enforcement of the terms of the Settlement Agreement, and all parties hereto submit to the jurisdiction of the Court for purposes of implementing and enforcing the settlement embodied in the Settlement Agreement.

10.11 As used herein, "he" means "he, she, or it;" "his" means "his, hers, or its," and "him" means "him, her, or it."

10.12 All dollar amounts are in United States dollars (USD).

10.13 Cashing a settlement check is a condition precedent to any Settlement Class Member's right to receive settlement benefits. All settlement checks shall be void ninety (90) days

after issuance and shall bear the language: “This check must be cashed within ninety (90) days, after which time it is void.” If a check becomes void, the Settlement Class Member shall have until six (6) months after the Effective Date to request re-issuance by the Claims Administrator.

10.14 If no request for re-issuance is made within this period, the Settlement Class Member will have failed to meet a condition precedent to recovery of settlement benefits, the Settlement Class Member’s right to receive monetary relief shall be extinguished, and Spencer Gifts shall have no obligation to make payments to the Settlement Class Member for expense reimbursement under ¶ 2.1 or any other type of monetary relief. The same provisions shall apply to any re-issued check. For any checks that are issued or re-issued for any reason more than one hundred eighty (180) days from the Effective Date, requests for re-issuance need not be honored after such checks become void.

10.15 All agreements made and orders entered during the course of the Litigation relating to the confidentiality of information shall survive this Settlement Agreement.

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, the parties hereto have caused the Settlement Agreement to be executed by their duly authorized attorneys.

[Signatures on the following page]

AGREED TO BY:

**MILBERG COLEMAN BRYSON
PHILLIPS GROSSMAN, PLLC**

By: David Lietz
David Lietz (Aug 17, 2022 10:49 EDT)
David K. Lietz
5335 Wisconsin Ave., NW, Ste. 440
Washington, D.C. 20015
Tel: (855)252-0878
Fax: (202) 686-2877
dlietz@milberg.com

CHAFFIN LUHANA LLP

Roopal P. Luhana
Steven D. Cohn (*PHV forthcoming*)
600 3rd Ave., 12th Floor
New York, New York 10016
Tel: (888) 480-1123
Fax: (888) 499-1123
luhana@chaffinluhana.com
cohn@chaffinluhana.com

Counsel for Plaintiff

BAKER & HOSTETLER, LLP

By: Eric Fish
Eric Fish (Aug 17, 2022 12:51 EDT)
Eric R. Fish (Attorney ID: 019001998)
45 Rockefeller Plaza
New York, New York 10111
Phone: (212) 589-4200
Fax: (212) 589-4201
Email: efish@bakerlaw.com

Counsel for Defendant Spencer Gifts LLC